

Dena C. Sharp (State Bar No. 245869)  
Jordan Elias (State Bar No. 228731)  
Adam E. Polk (State Bar No. 273000)

**GIRARD SHARP LLP**

601 California Street, Suite 1400  
San Francisco, California 94108  
Tel: (415) 981-4800  
Fax: (415) 981-4846  
dsharp@girardsharp.com  
jelias@girardsharp.com  
apolk@girardsharp.com

Eric H. Gibbs (State Bar No. 178658)  
Amy M. Zeman (State Bar No. 273100)

**GIBBS LAW GROUP LLP**

505 14th Street, Suite 1110  
Oakland, CA 94162  
Tel: (510) 350-9700  
amz@classlawgroup.com

Adam B. Wolf (State Bar No. 215914)  
Tracey B. Cowan (State Bar No. 250053)

**PEIFFER WOLF CARR & KANE, A  
PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION**

4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel: (415) 766-3545  
Fax: (415) 402-0058  
awolf@pwcklegal.com  
tcowan@pwcklegal.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs and Interim Class Counsel*

[Additional Counsel on Signature Page]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE PACIFIC FERTILITY CENTER  
LITIGATION

Elizabeth J. Cabraser (State Bar No. 083151)  
Lexi J. Hazam (State Bar No. 224457)  
Sarah R. London (State Bar No. 267083)  
Tiseme G. Zegeye (State Bar No. 319927)

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 Battery Street, 29th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339  
Tel.: (415) 956-1000  
Fax: (415) 956-1008  
ecabraser@lchb.com  
lhazam@lchb.com  
slondon@lchb.com  
tzegeye@lchb.com

Case No. 3:18-cv-01586-JSC

**JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT  
STATEMENT**

Judge: Hon. Jacqueline Scott Corley

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 16-10(d), the parties provide this Joint Case Management Statement in advance of the Further Case Management Conference scheduled for April 9, 2020.

### **I. ADR UPDATE**

The parties participated in a mediation session with Hon. Edward A. Infante (Ret.) on March 16. Judge Infante has continued discussions with each of the parties and the mediation remains ongoing. The parties will be prepared to provide a status update at the conference.

### **II. DEVELOPMENTS SINCE THE LAST STATUS CONFERENCE**

Since the February 27, 2020 case management conference and class certification hearing, there have been several developments.

First, as a result of the COVID-19 crisis, Plaintiffs have taken the previously noticed March and April depositions of PFC doctors and Pacific MSO embryologists off-calendar on the understanding that these noticed parties will make their witnesses available in May, unless the travel and work restrictions remain in place, in which case the parties will confer concerning how to proceed, as explained in further detail below.

Second, the parties have continued to meet and confer concerning existing (and some new) discovery issues, as outlined below.

### **III. DISCOVERY STATUS**

**Case Schedule.** Defendants have raised with Plaintiffs adjusting the case schedule in light of the significant challenges they contend the COVID-19 crisis has presented for discovery and depositions. While the parties have not discussed any specific proposed alterations to the current schedule, they have agreed to confer regarding the case schedule, and will be prepared to update the Court at the conference.

**Deposition Scheduling & COVID-19.** While the parties had previously agreed on dates in March and April 2020 for the depositions of four PFC physicians and four Pacific MSO embryologists, in light of the COVID-19 crisis, the parties agreed to reschedule the depositions for May 2020, with the understanding that the parties will revisit the schedule and meet and confer about the best way to proceed if it appears that the stay-home and shelter-in-place orders will remain in effect by then. Pacific MSO has provided May dates for the embryologist depositions. By April 10, PFC and Prelude will

1 provide May dates for the depositions of the physicians and a 30(b)(6) witness designated to testify on  
2 financial topics, respectively.<sup>1</sup> The parties are meeting and conferring about time limits for these  
3 depositions as the noticed depositions will exceed the 90-hour limit raised at the previous case  
4 management conference.

5 **Disputes Regarding Additional Depositions.** The parties are meeting and conferring on the  
6 need for additional depositions that Plaintiffs believe good cause exists to take. Prelude disagrees that  
7 these remaining depositions are relevant or necessary and Defendants object to Plaintiffs' proposed  
8 extension of the previously agreed-to deposition limits. Plaintiffs have agreed to refrain from  
9 immediately noticing the additional depositions they have raised with Prelude and have agreed to  
10 continue to confer regarding the need for the depositions. Plaintiffs and Defendants reserve their rights  
11 to seek judicial relief if they cannot reach an agreement.

12 **Outcome Data.** The parties have reached impasse on the issue of Pacific MSO's production of  
13 outcome data for a series of thaws Pacific MSO performed on Tank 4 materials in the weeks following  
14 the incident. Pacific MSO has withheld the only documentation relating to those thaws as privileged and  
15 work product. Plaintiffs disagree that the test thaw outcome data is properly withheld as privileged or  
16 work product, and the parties have agreed to submit the issue to the Court for resolution by way of joint  
17 letter no later than April 16.

18 In addition to the thaw outcome data issue referenced above, the parties continue to confer  
19 regarding Pacific MSO's recent production of egg and embryo data, including Plaintiffs' requests for  
20 updated Tank 4 outcome data comparable to data produced to reporting bodies for non-Tank 4 eggs and  
21 embryos. The parties will be prepared to update the Court regarding the status of their discussions at the  
22 conference.

23 **Prelude Document Production.**

24 ***Financial Condition Documents.*** Plaintiffs and Prelude continue to confer regarding Prelude's  
25 production of documents concerning its financial condition in response to Plaintiffs' punitive damages

---

26 <sup>1</sup> Plaintiffs have also requested a follow up Rule 30(b)(6) deposition on Prelude's organizational  
27 structure, but at Prelude's request, are exploring possible alternatives—including propounding  
28 interrogatories, or providing alternative organizational topics—and will be prepared to update the Court  
on status at the conference.

1 discovery. The parties are conferring over Prelude's search for and production of documents and will be  
2 prepared to update the Court concerning their meet and confer efforts.

3 **Status of Document Production.** Plaintiffs sent Prelude correspondence relating to the recent  
4 production of documents by a third party (Lee Equity), which raised questions for Plaintiffs about the  
5 completeness of Prelude's production. Prelude contends that its production is complete. The parties have  
6 agreed to confer about this issue and will be prepared to provide a status update at the conference.

7 **Tank Testing.** Further tank testing occurred on March 11, 12, and 13. The parties are evaluating  
8 the results, and some metallurgical testing of specific samples is ongoing. The parties do not currently  
9 contemplate additional testing, but further analysis of the data gathered during the recent testing session  
10 and the metallurgical outcomes may alter that determination.

11 **Chart Discovery.** Plaintiffs served requests for admission, interrogatories, and production of  
12 documents on Chart in January. Chart responded in February, and following the February 27 conference  
13 provided supplemental responses to interrogatories and requests for production. Plaintiffs are evaluating  
14 Chart's responses and will raise any issues the parties are unable to resolve after conferring, in the event  
15 they arise.

16 **Authentication of Documents.** Plaintiffs have requested that Defendants stipulate to the  
17 authenticity of documents they produced in the litigation to avoid the need for depositions of document  
18 custodians or requests for admission. The parties have not yet reached agreement, but are conferring and  
19 will be prepared to update the Court concerning this issue at the conference.

20 **Privilege Log Dispute.** Following the Court's March 16 Order, Dkt. No. 423, Prelude and  
21 Pacific MSO submitted 17 documents for *in camera* review on March 20, 2020.

#### 22 **IV. PFC ARBITRATION PROCEEDINGS AND THIRD-PARTY COMPLAINT**

23 Arbitration proceedings have not yet begun. PFC has paid its fees in 91 cases. Its counsel reports  
24 that it has processed invoices for an additional 100 cases and is awaiting payment for those cases by the  
25 insurance carrier. In addition to those already processed, PFC anticipates processing payments for 11  
26 other cases for which they recently received further information.

27 In view of the fact that arbitrations have been delayed nearly 9 months (most were initiated July  
28 2019), and PFC has repeatedly committed—yet failed to—pay its fees, Plaintiffs have requested that

1 PFC pay its arbitration fees no later than April 9.<sup>2</sup> Plaintiffs reserve their rights to seek to compel PFC to  
2 return to this Court in the event its continued failure to pay its fees prevents Plaintiffs' ability to seek  
3 relief in arbitration in accordance with the Court's order.

4 The Court dismissed Chart's third-party complaint with leave to amend at the February 27  
5 hearing. Pursuant to stipulation, Chart is scheduled to file its amended third-party complaint on April 9.

6 \* \* \*

7 The parties request that the Court hold another status conference at the Court's convenience in  
8 mid- to late May, with a further joint case management statement to be submitted a week before the  
9 conference.

10 Dated: April 3, 2020

**GIRARD SHARP LLP**

11 By: /s/ Dena C. Sharp

12 Dena C. Sharp (State Bar No. 245869)

13 Jordan Elias (State Bar No. 228731)

14 Adam E. Polk (State Bar No. 273000)

**GIRARD SHARP LLP**

601 California Street, Suite 1400

San Francisco, California 94108

Tel: (415) 981-4800

Fax: (415) 981-4846

dsharp@girardsharp.com

jelias@girardsharp.com

apolk@girardsharp.com

19 Eric H. Gibbs (State Bar No. 178658)

20 Dylan Hughes (State Bar No. 209113)

21 Amy M. Zeman (State Bar No. 273100)

**GIBBS LAW GROUP LLP**

505 14th Street, Suite 1110

Oakland, CA 94162

Tel: (510) 350-9700

amz@classlawgroup.com

25 Adam B. Wolf (State Bar No. 215914)

Tracey B. Cowan (State Bar No. 250053)

27 <sup>2</sup> PFC most recently apprised the Court that its fees would be paid by the end of March 2020. Dkt.  
28 No. 401. At a status conference in November 2019, PFC said that it was in the process of paying its fees.

**PEIFFER WOLF CARR & KANE, A  
PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION**

4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400

San Francisco, CA 94111

Tel: (415) 766-3545

Fax: (415) 402-0058

awolf@pwcklegal.com

tcowan@pwcklegal.com

Elizabeth J. Cabraser (State Bar No. 083151)

Lexi J. Hazam (State Bar No. 224457)

Sarah R. London (State Bar No. 267083)

Tiseme G. Zegeye (State Bar No. 319927)

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 Battery Street, 29th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111-3339

Tel.: 415.956.1000

Fax: 415.956.1008

ecabraser@lchb.com

lhazam@lchb.com

slondon@lchb.com

tzegeye@lchb.com

*Interim Class Counsel*

Joseph G. Sauder (*pro hac vice*)

**SAUDER SCHELKOPF LLC**

555 Lancaster Avenue

Berwyn, Pennsylvania 19312

Tel: (610) 200-0580

jgs@sstriallawyers.com

*Plaintiffs' Counsel*

Dated: April 3, 2020

By: /s/ Erin M. Bosman

Erin M. Bosman (State Bar No. 204987)

William F. Tarantino (State Bar No. 215343)

Julie Y. Park (State Bar No. 259929)

**MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP**

425 Market Street

San Francisco, California 94105

Tel: (415) 268-7000

EBosman@mofo.com

WTarantino@mofo.com

JuliePark@mofo.com

*Counsel for Defendant Prelude Fertility, Inc. and  
Pacific MSO, LLC*

Dated: April 3, 2020

By: /s/ Molly Moriarty Lane  
Molly Moriarty Lane (State Bar No. 149206)  
Benjamin P. Smith (State Bar No. 197551)  
Megan A. Suehiro (State Bar No. 316104)  
**MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**  
One Market Street, Spear Street Tower  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1596  
Tel: (415) 442-1000  
Fax: (415) 442-1001  
molly.lane@morganlewis.com  
benjamin.smith@morganlewis.com  
megan.suehiro@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Defendant Chart Inc.*

**FILER'S ATTESTATION**

Pursuant to Civil L.R. 5-1(i)(3), regarding signatures, I, Dena C. Sharp attest that concurrence in  
the filing of this document has been obtained.

Dated: April 3, 2020

/s/ Dena C. Sharp

Christina (Dena) C. Sharp